



Rural Development

September 21, 2018

Joel C. Baxley
Administrator

Rural Housing Service
1400 Independence Ave, SW
Room 5014-S
Washington, D.C. 20250

Telephone: (202) 692-0268

TO: State Directors
Rural Development

ATTN: Program Directors
Multi-Family Housing

FROM: Joel C. Baxley /s/ *Joel C. Baxley*
Administrator
Rural Housing Service

SUBJECT: Allowable Expenses in Multi-Family Housing Properties

PURPOSE

The purpose of this Unnumbered Letter (UL) is to clarify allowable expenses to be paid by project income in Rural Development-financed Section 515 and Section 514 multifamily properties. It is one of a series of ULs providing guidance to Servicing Officials to ensure the appropriate use of project funds. This is in further accordance with a recommendation from the Office of the Inspector General (OIG) in their audit “Review of Rural Rental Housing’s Tenant and Owner Data using Data Analytics”, Audit No. 04901-001-13. The Agency previously issued a UL on this subject on April 28, 2017.

BACKGROUND

OIG previously conducted an audit of expenses charged to properties financed under the Multi-Family Housing (MFH) Direct Loan programs. A recommendation agreed to by the Agency was to provide periodic reminders to program participants regarding allowable and unallowable expenses. Also, this UL also addresses questions received from State and Servicing Offices.

The Direct Loan programs are governed by the MFH regulation 7 CFR 3560; allowable expenses appear in §3560.102 (generally, management fee-related) and §3560.303 (project-related). Procedural guidance to Servicing Officials about reviewing proposed budgets and actual expense reports is set out in the MFH Asset Management Handbook, HB-2-3560, Chapter 4. The clarifications provided in this UL supplement that guidance by listing the existing allowable expenses listed in §3560.102 and §3560.303 and providing additional clarification.

EXPIRATION DATE:
September 30, 2019

FILING INSTRUCTIONS:
Housing Programs

AGENCY ACTION

Servicing Officials have a responsibility to ensure that MFH project funds are being used appropriately. MFH properties rely on project income to maintain operations and provide safe, decent and sanitary housing for our residents. Rent increases are necessary at times to generate needed revenue to pay for ongoing maintenance, capital improvements, and immediate repairs, as well as to cover administrative costs associated with management of the property. To achieve these objectives, it is necessary and proper for Servicing Officials to thoroughly review budget submissions, ask questions, and seek documentation that support budget requests or actual expenses.

Servicing Officials are advised to more closely review certain expense categories that have the potential for abuse, and to apply reasonableness tests where needed. 7 CFR 3560.102(i)(3)(iii) addresses this reasonableness determination and further suggests that where administrative expenses exceed 23 percent or those typical for the area of gross potential basic income, a need for closer review of unnecessary expenditures is called for. This does not mean there is a 23 percent cap on administrative expenses or that expenses above 23 percent are not allowed. Rather, the Servicing Official should examine more closely those line items to ensure the charges are appropriate.

Conversely, this does not mean that if administrative expenses are less than 23 percent, no further review is necessary; to the contrary, the Servicing Official still needs to determine if the charges are allowable. As a reminder, RD Form 3560-13, "*Multi-Family Project Borrower's/Management Agent's Management Agent Certification*", includes the following section:

"4. The Agent agrees to:

- a. Ensure that all expenses of the project are reasonable and necessary.
- b. Exert reasonable effort to maximize project income and take advantage of discounts, rebates and similar money-saving techniques.
- c. Obtain contracts, materials, supplies and services including the preparation of the annual financial reports on terms most advantageous to the project.
- d. Credit the housing project with all discounts, rebates or commissions including any sales or property tax relief granted by the State or local Government received.
- e. Obtain the necessary verbal or written cost estimates and document reasons for accepting other than the lowest bid.
- f. Maintain copies of the documentation and make such documentation available for inspection during normal business hours.
- g. Invest project funds that Rural Development policies require to be invested and take reasonable effort to invest other project funds unless the borrower specifically directs the Agent not to invest those funds."

IMPLEMENTATION

Servicing Officials identified certain expense items that have raised questions during reviews of proposed budgets and actual operating expense reports. On Attachment A, these items have been

associated to the related citation in the MFH regulation, and procedural clarifications are provided. These procedural clarifications will appear in the next revision of HB-2-3560, the MFH Asset Management Handbook.

Servicing Officials are to bring this guidance to the attention of MFH borrowers and management agents to ensure they understand program regulations concerning allowable expenses and the responsibilities of MFH staff to critically evaluate proposed operating budgets and actual operating expenses.

Servicing Officials should direct questions regarding the subject of this UL to their assigned Portfolio Management Analyst or any staff member of the Portfolio Management Division.

Attachment

GUIDANCE ON ALLOWABLE AND UNALLOWABLE PROJECT EXPENSES

Text in boxed italics following the regulation citation provides clarification on allowable expenses.

§3560.303 (b) Allowable and unallowable project expenses. Expenses charged to project operations, whether for management agent services or other expenses, must be reasonable, typical, necessary and show a clear benefit to the residents of the property. Services and expenses charged to the property must show value added and be for authorized purposes.

- (1) Allowable expenses. Allowable expenses include those expenses that are directly attributable to housing project operations and are necessary to carry out successful operations.
 - (i) Housing project expenses must not duplicate expenses included in the management fee as defined in §3560.102(i).

Housing Authorities should only include cost directly associated with the operations of the MFH financed property.

- (ii) Actual costs for direct personnel costs of permanent and part-time staff assigned directly to the project site. This includes managers, maintenance staff, and temporary help including their:

On-site staff costs (including maintenance employees directly assigned) are project expenses. If staff is responsible for multiple properties, then their costs should be prorated between each property. Regional managers' costs are to be covered by the management fee.

Payroll and fringe benefits expenses included in the proposed budget must agree with the number of employees, positions, salaries, fringe benefits, health plans, etc. in the management plan and the property must be able to cash flow with the included expense(s).

On-site personnel who oversee multiple properties must pro-rate the expense of benefits between properties. Wages will be charged per billing method to the property.

Large increases in site payroll or site maintenance should be supported by management plan changes. Rural Development does not have to approve a budget that includes positions that are not shown in the management plan.

To be a project expense tasks must be project specific in nature.

Payment of supervisory positions are paid from the management fee bundle of services and not from project operations. See §3560.102(i)(1)(i).

- (A) Gross salary;
- (B) Employer Federal Insurance Contributions Act;
- (C) Federal unemployment tax;
- (D) State unemployment tax;

- (E) Workers compensation insurance;
- (F) Health insurance premiums;

-The management plan should identify site personnel. If there is a question about health insurance coverage for site employees, Servicing Officials should review the health insurance policy for confirmation of coverage and appropriate charges to the project.
-Management's central office staff's health insurance is not a project expense.

- (G) Cost of fidelity or comparable insurance;
- (H) Leasing, performance incentive or annual bonuses;

-This expense is for project-specific site personnel and should be included as part of the site compensation.

- (I) Direct costs of travel to off-site locations by on-site staff for property business or training; and/or

-On-site staff travel to and from the management company office to the property is an allowable expense. However, such travel should be reasonable. For example, maintenance staff should not routinely be sent out from the main office to do one thing each day when it would be more efficient to combine trips or can be completed by the on-site maintenance person.
-Other management company staff travel to and from the property is a management fee expense (see §3560.102 (i)(1)(xiii)(I)).
-Purchase of "company vehicles" for such travel is not an allowable project expense.

- (J) Retirement benefits.

- (iii) Legal fees directly related to the operation and management of the property including tenant lease enforcement actions, property tax appeals and suits, and the preparation of all legal documents.

-Property legal fees are for the borrower or the project, and not for third-parties, such as investors or syndicators.
-Fees must be paid by borrowers from non-project funds for fines, penalties and legal fees when the borrowers are found guilty of civil rights or other violations. Per 7 CFR 3560.102 (i)(4)(ii) "... Where there is no finding of a borrower's fault, commercially reasonable legal expenses and costs for defending or settling lawsuits (without admission of liability) are allowable.

- (iv) All outside account and auditing fees, if required by the Agency, directly related to the preparation of the annual audit, partnership tax returns and 401-K's, as well as other outside reports and year-end reports to the Agency, or other Governmental agency.

-The account, auditing, partnership, and year end reports must be directly related to the property. It does not include individual tax filing expenses for any member of the ownership entity. Properties may have financial reporting requirements beyond that required by the Agency. If these are directly related to the property, and not the partnership or ownership, they are allowable project expenses.

-There are no regulatory caps on the audit expense; however, if costs exceed the average for similar properties, confirm the audit is not of the partnership etc., which is a borrower expense.

-Utilize Agency reports to assist in the comparison process of similar properties.

(v) All repair and maintenance costs for the project including:

-Repair and maintenance expenses appear on RD Form 3560-07 in Part II, lines 1-11. Capital expenses, which are discussed in §3560.103(c), should not appear in the operating repair and maintenance costs; capital budget expenses appear in Part V.

- Maintenance staff should not routinely be sent out from the main office to do one thing each day when it would be more efficient to combine trips or can be completed by the on-site maintenance person.

-There should be no manipulation of the budget or expenses to avoid taxes.

-The reserve account should not be used to pay for typical unit turnover or routine maintenance costs; these should appear in the operating budget. Excessive repairs due to (for example) death in the unit, drug production clean up or extreme vandalism is not typical unit turnover.

-Servicing Officials should question unusually low maintenance and repairs costs, especially in aging properties.

- (A) Maintenance staffing costs and related expenses.
- (B) Maintenance supplies.

Servicing Officials should carefully review this item. Small tool purchases, such as hammers, putty knives, and sprayers, which could be used repetitively, should not be repeatedly purchased by the property.

- (C) Contract repairs to the projects (e.g., heating and air conditioning, painting, roofing).
- (D) Make ready expenses including painting and repairs, flooring replacement and appliance replacement as well as drapery or mini- blind replacement. (Turnover maintenance).
- (E) Preventive maintenance expenses including occupied unit repairs and maintenance as well as common area systems repairs and maintenance.
- (F) Snow removal.
- (G) Elevator repairs and maintenance contracts.
- (H) Section 504 and other Fair Housing compliance modifications and maintenance.

-Annual reviews updating of transition plans by management should be completed with budgets and actual financial reviews. An explanation for the lack of work and not following the transition plan schedule should be provided.

-It is not a reasonable expense to complete a transition plan every three years, especially if none of the items have been corrected or completed since the initial plan. Management should review the existing plan annually with a year-end update.

-There is no requirement that a transition plan be done by a third-party. However, the plan should be completed by a trained, knowledgeable party.

-Future changes may occur to the property as a result of maintenance work, at which point, if it is not clear that the proper work is completed, a further self-evaluation and transition plan may be needed.

-If there is a change in the applicable standard or circumstances at the property the Transition Plan should be updated. The Servicing Official should determine if the borrower's financial situation is such that completion of the Transition Plan can be accomplished.

-The cost of providing limited English proficiency services is an allowable expense.

- (I) Landscaping maintenance, replacements, and seasonal plantings.
- (J) Pest control services.

-This includes the expense of bed bug control. If the property is experiencing unusual pest activity or an unusually high expense, Servicing Officials should request a breakdown of costs.

- (K) Other related maintenance expenses.

-“Other maintenance expenses” is a broad category that should be carefully reviewed by Servicing Officials to ensure that charges are appropriate and reasonable. Expenses that belong in other categories should be moved by the borrower to ensure that the Agency is collecting the correct data on specific property costs.

-If the expense appears on Part II, line 10, it must be identified.

- (vi) All operational costs related to the project including:

-“Sales tax” on management fees is not an allowable expense unless state law requires “sales tax”.

-“Other Administrative” in general: Servicing Officials should closely review this line item for potential abuse. “Other Administrative” should include only directly property-related administrative costs; for example, the Section 538 Guarantee Fee is an allowable expense. A break out of the expenses should be provided with the narrative.

-Bad debts should not appear in the operational costs.

-On the proposed budget, bad debts will appear as a contingency item (Part I).

-On the actual expenses, bad debts would be reflected in less income than expected.
-Other fees and charges should appear in the appropriate line item (i.e., bank charges, Housing Finance Agency (HFA) compliance fees, credit checks, etc.) Such expenses must be accompanied by a narrative with detailed explanation.
-For-profit borrowers are entitled to 25 percent of the interest earnings on the reserve account in the prior year, which should be a reserve withdrawal request; this amount should not be taken from the operating account. See §3560.306(h)(3).

- (A) The costs of obtaining and receiving credit reports, police reports, and other checks related to tenant selection criteria for prospective residents.

The cost of these items may be charged as an application fee as long as it does not exceed the actual cost of obtaining the necessary items related to the tenant selection criteria.

- (B) The cost of duplicating forms for those properties not owning a copier. This will include the costs of producing or purchasing forms and mailing or delivering those forms to the project site.

Photocopying or printing expense related to actual production of project brochures, marketing pieces, forms, reports, notices, and newsletters which all directly relate to the property in question are allowable project expenses no matter what location or point of origin the work is performed. This includes outsourcing the work to a professional printer.

- (C) All bank charges related to the property including purchases of supplies (e.g., checks, deposit slips, returned check fees, service fees).

Bank charges should be typical and not extraordinary; bank-charged late fees should be closely reviewed for reasonableness and not due to mismanagement. Electronic check readers and lockbox fees are an allowable project expense.

- (D) Costs of site-based telephone including initial installation, basic services, directory listings, and long-distance charges.

Cell phones issued to on-site personnel for project-related work is allowable. On-site personnel who oversee multiple properties must pro-rate the expense between properties.
An allowance to a site personal for use of a personal cell phone is acceptable.

- (E) All advertising costs related specifically to the operations of that project. This can include advertising for applicants or employees in newspapers, newsletters, radio, cable TV, and telephone books.

This includes social media.

- (F) Postage and delivery costs from the site including expenses to the Agency or other Governmental agencies, tenants, verifying third parties, central management offices, etc.

Postage expenses associated with the site to mail out rental applications, third-party (asset income and adjustments to income) verifications, application processing correspondence (acceptance or denial letters), mailing project invoice payments, required correspondence, report submittals to various regulatory authorities to the managed property are allowable project expenses no matter what location or point of origin the mail is generated. This expense does not include normal or routine management company personnel responsibilities covered under §3560.102(i)(1)(xiii)(C).

- (G) Partnership or corporate business expenses including State taxes and other mandated State or local fees as well as other relevant expenses required for operation of the property by a third- party Governmental unit. Costs of continuation financing statements and site license and permit costs.
- (H) Expenses related to site utilities including actual costs and surcharges as well as deposits and expense of utility bonds in lieu of bonds.
- (I) Site office furniture and equipment including site-based computer and copiers. Service agreements and warranties for copiers, telephone systems and computers are also included (if approved by the Agency).

Items must be part of a proposed approved budget to be an eligible expense. Explain in narrative.

- (J) Real estate taxes (personal tangible property and real property taxes) and expenses related to controlling or reducing taxes.

Late Fees due to mismanagement must be paid by borrowers from non-project funds.

- (K) All costs of insurance including property liability and casualty as well as fidelity or crime and dishonesty coverage for on-site employees and the owners.
- (L) Costs of collecting rents on-site including bookkeeping supplies and recordkeeping items.

Note that these costs are for supplies such as notices: Costs of processing transactions, maintaining books and records are covered as part of the management fee. See 3560.102(i)(1)(iii).

- (M) Costs of preparing and maintaining tenant files and processing tenant certifications including all office supplies, copies and other associated expenses.

-Office supplies, copies and other associated expenses needed to physically establish and maintain tenant files must be site-specific.
-The project management staff is responsible for the labor in preparing, reviewing, submission and maintaining tenant files and that cost is part of the salary expense to be paid by the management fee. 3560.102(i)(1)(xi).
-Costs associated with off-site tenant file storage, physical or digital, are allowable project expenses.
-Processing tenant certifications include the transmission/submission of tenant certifications is covered by the management fee §3560.102(i)(1)(xi), is not an allowable project expense and there should not be an additional fee.
-Projects should not be double charged for “front-line fees” at a prorated rate and having personnel who are responsible for performing the same task being paid a salary is not acceptable.

- (N) Public relations expense relative to maintaining positive relationships between the local community and the tenants with the management staff and the borrowers. Chamber of Commerce dues, contributions to local charity events, and sponsorship of tenant activities, are examples.
- (O) Tax Credit Compliance Monitoring Fees imposed by HFA.

-This expense pays the charge from the tax credit allocator.
-Reporting to general and limited partners for Low Income Housing Tax Credits (LIHTC), compliance purposes are included in the management fee and is not an allowable project expense; see §3560.102(i)(1)(xxvii). These fees can be paid from either management fee or Return to Owner.

- (P) All insurance deductibles as well as adjuster expenses.
- (Q) Professional service contracts (audits and compilations, tax returns, energy audits, utility allowances, architectural, construction, rehabilitation and inspection contracts, etc.)

-If costs appear unreasonable Servicing Officials should review any professional services contracts.
-The Agency has no monthly unit inspection requirement.
-Inappropriate practices are covered under §3560.102(i)(4)(viii).
-The cost of installation of project-wide cable, satellite TV, or wi-fi/Internet, is an allowable project expense, provided that each apartment unit receives a separate billing for the service, and it is not included in the rent charge or utility allowance. The property will not pay for access by each unit, including vacant units. Management could negotiate a service fee for the property and collect the monthly fee from each tenant. The budget would reflect other income source from the tenants and a cable expense in operations and maintenance. With an explanation in the narrative or comments.

(R) On-site training pre-approved by the Agency provided by outside training vendors.

-Training for on-site staff should be appropriate to managing affordable housing with subsidies from Rural Development, the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development, or LIHTC. Suspected abuses should require documentation of the course or certifications received.
-Site training planned or completed should be explained in the narrative.
-Site staff who oversee multiple properties must pro-rate the expense between properties.
-Borrowers who attend trainings do so at their own expense and it is not an allowable project expense.
-Management company meetings to discuss management policies are a management fee expense (see §3560.102(i)(1)(xiv), (xv), (xxiv) and (xxv)).
-Expenses during training should be reasonable and not involve costs for items previously identified by the OIG audit, especially gifts, bonuses (other than that identified in the management plan as part of the site manager's salary), or alcohol. Training expenses may include reasonable hotel charges, meals, and snacks; such expenses should not be excessive.

(S) Site manager salary for additional hours associated with congregate housing.

(vii) With prior Agency approval, cooperatives and non-profit organizations may use housing project funds to pay asset management expenses directly attributable to ownership responsibilities. Such expenses may include:

- (A) Errors and omissions insurance policy for the Board of Directors.
- (B) Board of Directors' review and approval of proposed Agency's annual operating budgets, including proposed repair and replacement outlays and accruals.
- (C) Board of Directors' review and approval of capital expenditures, financial statements, and consideration of any management comments noted.
- (D) Long-term asset management reviews.

A non-profit asset management fee may be requested by non-profits and cooperatives. Non-profit owners are entitled to up to \$7,500 per project for certain organizational expenses, such as errors and omissions insurance and actual expenses prorated by the number of Rural Development projects. When reviewing the justification, and the organization expenses attributed to each property, the owner should make sure that the expenses are prorated across all the properties, and each expense is not charged in full to each property. For example - if the errors and omissions insurance policy for the Board of Directors is covering all the properties and costs \$3,000, the \$3,000 needs to be prorated for all their non-profit properties and non-profit properties cannot charge \$3,000 per property for the insurance policy.

(2) Unallowable expenses. Housing project funds may not be used for any of the following:

- (i) Equity skimming as defined in 42 U.S.C. 543 (a).
- (ii) Purposes unrelated to the housing project.
- (iii) Reimbursement of inaccurate or false claims.
- (iv) Settlement agreements, court ordered decrees, legal fees, or other costs that result from the filing of civil rights complaints or legal action alleging the borrower, or a representative of the borrower, has committed a civil rights violation.

Borrowers must pay from non-project funds for fines, penalties and legal fees when the borrowers are found guilty of civil rights or other violations. Per 7 CFR 3560.102 (i)(4)(ii) "... Where there is no finding of a borrower's fault, commercially reasonable legal expenses and costs for defending or settling lawsuits (without admission of liability) are allowable.

- (v) Fines, penalties, and legal fees where the borrower or a borrower's representative has been found guilty of violating laws, including, but not limited to, civil rights, and building codes.
- (vi) Association dues to be paid by the project should be related to training for site managers or management agents. To the extent that association dues can document training for site managers or management agents related to project activities by actual cost or pro-ration, a reasonable expense may be billed to the project.
- (vii) Pay for bonuses or monetary performance awards to site managers or management agents that are not clearly provided for by the site manager salary contract.
- (viii) Billing for parties that are large or unreasonable, such as renting expensive party halls or hotel rooms and payment for alcoholic beverages or gifts to management agent staff.
- (ix) Billing for practices that are inefficient such as routine use of collect calls from a site manager to a management agent office.

(c) Priorities. The priority order of planned and actual budget expenditures will be:

1. Senior position lienholder, if any;
2. Operating and maintenance expenses, including taxes and insurance;
3. Agency debt payments;
4. Reserve account requirements;
5. Other authorized expenditures; and
6. Return on owner investment.

*-The expense of the Return to Owner (ROI) investment must be included in the proposed budget in order for the borrower to be eligible to collect the payment. §3560.305(a) includes the conditions on the return payment. §3560.305(b) discusses when an unpaid ROI may be taken:
- "An earned, but unpaid ROI for the previous year only may be requested by the borrower and authorized by the Agency under the provisions of §3560.305(a)(1) provided the current year's ROI has been paid first and a rent increase is not required to generate funds to pay the unpaid ROI."*